

http://bookofmormoncentral.org/

Type: Newsletter

Newsletter and Proceedings of the S.E.H.A., no. 124 (December 1970)

Editors(s): Ross T. Christensen, John C. Dey, and Bonny A. Fifield Published by: Society for Early Historic Archaeology, Brigham Young University

Archived by permission of the Ancient America Foundation

NEWSLETTER AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE

Number 124

Editor: Ross T. Christensen Assistant Editors: John C. Dey, Bonny A. Fifield December, 1970

Published several times a year by THE SOCIETY FOR EARLY HISTORIC ARCHAEOLOGY at Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah, for the dissemination among its members of information on new discoveries in archaeology throwing light on the origins of civilization in the Old and New Worlds, on the earliest periods of recorded history in the two hemispheres, and on the important historical claims of the Hebrew-Christian and Latter-day Saint scriptures; also news of the Society and its members and of the B.Y.U. department of archaeology and anthropology, of which the Society is an affiliated organization. Included are papers read at the Society's and Department's annual symposia on the archaeology of the Scriptures. All views expressed in this newsletter are those of the author of the contribution in which they appear and not necessarily those of Brigham Young University or the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Subscription is by membership in the Society, which also includes subscription to other publications.

124.0 BOOK OF ABRAHAM RESEARCH, 1969: THE BIG QUESTIONS STILL UNANSWERED. By Jay M. Todd, assistant managing editor of *The Improvement Era*. A paper read at the Nineteenth Annual Symposium on the Archaeology of the Scriptures, held at Brigham Young University on October 18, 1969.

(EDITOR'S NOTE: Since the presentation of his paper at the Symposium, Mr. Todd has been appointed editor of the LDS church magazine, *The New Era*, the first issue of which is scheduled to appear in January, 1971. Also, he is the author of the 1969 volume, *The Saga of the Book of Abraham*, which was reviewed in the *Newsletter and Proceedings*, 114.2. Mr. Todd's symposium paper, printed below, contains many allusions to his book.)

The following is a list of clues, tips, and information which if pursued will *unquestionably* resolve some of the major problems of background research on the Book of Abraham. For over 100 years we have been retelling the same stories, in some cases piling error upon error. More generally, however, we have just gone along, assuming that someone, in some great department in that unseen Building of Truth, will be assigned the task of solving the riddles and will then give us the answers. But such is not the way of life. Actually, if anyone is going to resolve these matters he will be someone from among those assembled here.

I have only one purpose in mind today: to enlist you *actively* in a research project. If this does not fill your bill, then one of us is in the wrong place. Assuredly, there exists no great department anywhere in the Church or in the world which alone has been assigned to search out the truth. If the background riddles of this amazingly complex and self-contradictory Lebolo-Chandler account are to be resolved, you, or someone like you, will have to do it.

When my list of ideas and suggestions for research appears in the SEHA Newsletter and Proceedings, won't you please pick one or two and begin to make your contribution? If you do not, your children-and maybe your grandchildren-will continue to tell a story that has never been proved correct, about how we got the Book of Abraham. When investigation of the story is undertaken it becomes a researcher's paradise. For this purpose we have gathered. You are the most concerned persons on these matters in existence; otherwise you would not be here. If you do not help, who will?

With this emotional appeal to rally to the cause, let us move on and identify some sources and clues. There is no question in my mind but that, if we investigate them, we can meet again at a future Symposium and bask in a knowledge of new truth behind the story of the Book of Abraham. So take your pick—and good luck!

DISCOVERY AT THEBES

1. Emma Smith reported in her bill-of-sale letter to Mr. A. Combs that the Antiquarian Society of Paris was involved. We need to review its records for any information concerning Lebolo and Thebes and the dates, June 7, 1831, and June, 1832. (Actually, the mummies Joseph Smith received are claimed to have been found as early as 1818 and as late as 1832. Because of these conflicting reports, then, our efforts must cover this entire 14-year period.) 2. We need to examine the French diplomatic corps records and others in the Louvre and the French Archives on the Antonio Lebolo story. There are a number of promising clues in this connection, for example Oliver Cowdery's report that 433 men worked four months and two days at the tomb.

3. The marvelous report in an 1835 issue of the Painesville *Telegraph* giving a description of the four mummies belonging to Joseph Smith constitutes a further reason to review the dates. June 7, 1831, and June, 1832. The *Telegraph*, moreover, actually describes the catacomb. Researchers may wish to check this out to see whether any known tomb agrees with it as to dimensions. Were this one simple thing done, it could open the door to identifying both the finder and the buyer of the mummies.

4. We should inspect the records of the British diplomatic corps, as well as those of the British Museum and the British Archives, for help on the same matters.

5. We ought also to search the records of Italy of the early 1820's, specifically of the Turin Museum and of Sardinia, for Drovetti's and Lebolo's involvement (cf. Newsletter, 95.72). Everything about Lebolo should be collected and catalogued until we find who this missing donor is. Also, the records of the Austrian Empire may hold some data of significance, for northern Italy was accountable to the Austrians during this period.

SOME PUBLISHED WORKS

6. We need to read *Il Corpo Epistolare di Bernardino Drovetti*, a book published in Rome in 1940 containing the letters of Drovetti. (Actually, only *some* of his letters are included. Nevertheless, the book needs to be checked very closely and the omitted letters also found and researched.) Remember, the more information we have on Lebolo, the better we can assess the Oliver Cowdery report.

7. It would be well to read, for the same reason, *Voyage dans le Levant*, Paris, 1819, by Philippe Auguste Forbin (1777-1842). He visited Egypt in 1818 and 1828 and ran into trouble with agents of Drovetti and Salt.

8. We should also read Giovanni Battista Belzoni's two-volume work, Narrative of Operations and Recent Discoveries in the Pyramids, Temples, Tombs and Excavations in Egypt and Nubia, 1820, and other writings of the same author; the works of Henry Salt, including The Life and Correspondence of Henry Salt, Esq.; writings of Giovanni d'Athanasi, such as A Brief Account of the Researches and Discoveries in Upper Egypt, etc.; the works of Baron Heinrich Carl Menu Minutoli, who bought mummies from Lebolo, including Mes Souvenirs en Egypte, Paris, 1826 (English edition, 1827); and the works of Frederic Cailliaud, including Voyage a l'Oasis de Thebes (2 vols., 1822-1824), Voyage a l'Oasis du Syouah (1823), and Voyage a Meroe (7 vols., 1823-1827).

ANTONIO LEBOLO

9. Some researchers have indicated that Castellamonte in northern Italy was the birthplace of Lebolo (thus, Richard Deland, in Papers of the Thirteenth Annual Symposium on the Archaeology of the Scriptures, p. 9. Ed.) Perhaps I concluded too hastily that data supplied me from Italy about an Antonio Lebolo born in Castellamonte, January 22, 1781, referred to the Lebolo of the Book of Abraham. With further checking, I have reason to believe he may be the same Lebolo as the one who died in that town on November 30, 1836, age 55. If so, he could not have died in Trieste in 1823 or 1832 (whichever is correct) and could not therefore be the one connected with Joseph Smith's papyri. Perhaps we have a clue in Belzoni's words, as reported by Stanley Mayes in The Great Belzoni (London, Putnam, 1959; this volume reviewed in the Newsletter, 95.42), that Lebolo was a gendarme in Milan. We ought to do some research in the records of that locale. The descendants of this rather illustrous man would surely know of his past, and could probably be located in Italy today. Anyone going to Europe for a vacation could perhaps spend three days in northern Italy and find these relatives.

10. Examination of the records of Italy, such as the *Ufficio di Registro*, would perhaps turn up Lebolo's will and devolution by sale or inheritance, of his property at death. Although 1 am pursuing this possibility myself through a researcher abroad, others may also wish to spend some time on it.

11. We need to search Letrone's and Champollion's writings for reference to a Lebolo mummy that arrived in Paris in 1824. The mummy was transferred to the Louvre in 1968.

12. According to a French researcher, we may find helpful data in Ledrain's Les Monuments de la Bibliotheque Nationale, Paris, 1881, pl. LXXXI-LXXXIV; in Schmidt's Sarkofager, Munie Kister og Muniehglotre, Copenhagen, 1914, p. 231; in Coche de la Ferte, Les Portraits Romains, Egyptiens du Louvre, Paris, 1852; and in Parlaska's Munien Portraits und Verwandte Denkmaler, Wiesbaden, 1966, p. 43 et sig, 152.

13. We need to look in the 1823 records of the Egyptian Society of London for an article by a Mr. Grey. Grey is supposed to have been an eye-witness to a Lebolo find. (See No. 15, below.)

14. It would be well to contact the Louvre, the Leyden Museum, the British Museum, the Turin Museum, and the Berlin Museum, asking for background data on all mummies and other materials in their possession connected with Lebolo or Drovetti.

15. We ought to learn all we can about Frederick Henniker, who, along with George Francis Grey (see No. 13, above), was an eye-witness to a Lebolo discovery. I have not read Grey's account, but I have read Henniker's for at least a part of ith and it is most interesting. (Incidentally, I have always wondered what the "II" stands for in Michael H. Chandler's name. Could it be for Henniker? The latter died in 1825, a bachelor and collector of antiquities. Several other family members also collected, and we have proof that this man purchased some Lebolo mummies!) Henniker's will could perhaps be found in the library of the Genealogical Society. Certainly the picture is worth exploring.

MICHAEL CHANDLER

16. We should examine the records of entry of Chandlers into America. Although I have reported a Chandler (Mike, age 32, laborer from Ireland, arrived in the United States in 1828 on the schooner *Eliza Jane*), he has not been proven to be the one we are after. We need a thorough review of the records for such a man, before 1835. (Dennis Stoddard McMurdie undertook a research project on Michael Chandler in 1964-65. See Newsletter, 95.73. Ed.)

17. There is a possibility that we have been looking in the wrong place-New York City-for information on the entry of the mummies into the US. In contrast to everyone else, B. II. Roberts said it was Philadelphia, which makes sense, for that is where Chandler was supposed to be living at the time. Thus, we need to examine the Port of Philadelphia records and cargo lists for mummies. (Cf. Dr. Sidney B. Sperry's early research along these lines as detailed in the Newsletter, 105.0, p. 3. Ed.)

18. We need to research the newspapers of Philadelphia to see whether that is the city in which the mummies were advertised, as Parley P. Pratt indicates.

19. Something that is almost sure to produce success is a search of the newspapers of cities on the exhibition trail that Chandler is said to have followed: Baltimore, Philadelphia, Cleveland, and Harrisburg-and all towns in their environs that had newspapers- beginning with July, 1835, and moving backward in time. (For example, Bel Air, a small town in Maryland, had a newspaper that reported Egyptian mummies on display- from Thebes.) A few hours spent at the microfilm viewer would be certain to produce success.

20. Someone could check the newspapers of Philadelphia of around December 10 and 17, 1833, the two days when Dr. Samuel George Morton dissected, before the Academy of Natural Sciences in the presence of 80 of its members, an Egyptian girl of 16, "brought from the catacombs near Thebes by the late Antonio Lebalo." (Cf. the findings of David C. Martin as reported in the Newsletter, 101.31. Ed.)

21. We should also peruse the records of the Academy of Natural Sciences in Philadelphia to see whether its minutes carry anything about this incident or report who sold Dr. Morton the mummy.

22. The head of this girl is apparently still in Dr. Morton's cabinet. Is there anyone in Philadelphia who can search for it and photograph it? It is the item marked No. 60 in Dr. Morton's catalogue of 1849.

(These last four clues are nearly 100 percent certain to turn up very interesting information, with some effort on our part.)

23. We might check the vital statistics including death records of Philadelphia for Michael H. Chandler, in case he returned and died there after selling the mummies.

JOSEPH SMITH

24. We need to scrutinize all newspapers published in and around Kirtland. Ohio, during the summer and fall of 1835, when Ezra Williams was carting the mummies around the countryside. Perhaps this would yield corroborative material in support of Chandler's placards (which we have) and Oliver Cowdery's story.

25. We need to trace the movements of Warren Parrish. Where did he go after leaving the LDS church in 1837? Would his descendants have any papers revealing how the translation of the Book of Abraham was accomplished?

26. It would be wise to check all books of reminiscences – a popular type of writing a century ago of those who lived in and around Kirtland, in order to pick up additional corroborative information. We already have some from such sources that is very helpful.

27. Kirtland-area records should be searched to learn the details of the incident of January 4, 1838, when Constable John P. Markell acquired some of the papyrus from the Prophet Joseph Smith.

28. It would be helpful to trace the movements of Reuben Hedlock, the man who carved the woodcuts for the 1842 publication of the facsimiles. Apparently, he left the Church. Did he write any papers or notes that can now be found among his descendants? (Hedlock is mentioned in the Newsletter, 71.0, p. 3, and 105.0, pp. 6 and 7. Ed.)

29. Mr. A. Combs: who was he? We know that he sold certain mummies in St. Louis. Also, some of the papyri he once held showed up in New York City in 1967 (Newsletter, 105.0). But what did he do with the other two mummies and the remaining papyri? If we

hope to trace down these antiquities we must first learn more about him.

30. A close scrutiny of Willard Richards' records might reveal notes about the translation of the Book of Abraham.

CHALLENGE

The list is sufficient for the present. If you will pick one, you may discover a long-sought-for answer. If you need help evaluating what you find, or want to see how it fits with other things, please fell free to contact me. I shall not only help you determine whether you have information of worth for an *Improvement Era* article by yourself, but will help you to search further, giving you all the clues I know of bearing on your project.

Simply stated, my thought is that we should work together on this kind of research, and I should like to be associated with people such as you who are using their time and talents in search of truth.

In my paper here this morning I might have taken up a variety of topics other than those which I finally chose, such as the foundation Dr. Sidney B. Sperry laid for this study over 30 years ago, or the contribution of Dr. James R. Clark. I might even have read some of the amazing reports, inspiring information, and new data that are in the pages of my own Saga of the Book of Abraham. Indeed, before coming here today I had actually mapped out two different presentations along such lines, but became convinced that in the 20 minutes allowed I should not be able to do either of them justice, under the title given me, "Book of Abraham Research, 1969."

I determined, therefore, not to tell you what other researchers had learned, but rather how you could help in this vitally important field of research. It occurred to me that if I were simply to list some areas of need, with some tips about how to proceed, great good could come of it. It is with the hope that you will choose one of these clues and pursue it, that I have come today.

124.1 MORE LIGHT ON TOMB OF LEBOLO'S DIS-COVERY. By Susan Stiles Taylor. Early in 1961, the present editor of the *Newsletter and Proceedings* tentatively identified Tomb 33 among the so-called private tombs at the Necropolis of ancient Thebes, Egypt, as that in which Antonio Lebolo in the early 1800's discovered the mummies which eventually resulted in the Book of Abraham. Later in 1961 Dr. Lynn M. Hilton, an SEHA member of long standing and presently superintendent of the Foreign Study League of Salt Lake City, travelled to Thebes, where he investigated Tomb 33 personally.

Then in 1963 Dr. Hilton, together with Dr. Ellis T.

Rasmussen, present chairman of the BYU Department of Ancient Scripture, led a BYU Travel Study tour to Bible lands and was able to visit the tomb a second time.

(Readers should consult the Newsletter, 87.0, for background information and details of the 1963 visit. This article was reprinted in *Mummies, Scrolls, and the Book of Abraham*, pp. 2, 3. Ed.)

Now, in 1970, Dr. Hilton has again visited and learned more concerning Tomb 33. In a letter to the editor, he reports the following:

"I had an opportunity to revisit Tomb 33 on January 4, 1970, in company with Mr. Don Blackwelder. In particular, we were eager to check on niches, interior columns, and brickwork... We found that since my original visit there with Dr. Rasmussen, the following changes had taken place:

"The Egyptian government had done a little excavating just outside the doorway leading into the tomb. In the process they had entirely removed the large cache of linen mummy wrappings that I described to you before (Newsletter, 87.03). Yet I did find many small fragments; however, none larger than a silver dollar. I also found fragments of mummy bones lying around, such as the ball joint of a human femur.

"The government had also removed the kerosene that used to be stored in the tomb and is presently using it as a warehouse for a very important collection of archaeological artifacts which is being assembled and which in the immediate future will be placed on display in the brand-new Luxor Museum.



Fig. 1. Ground plan of Tomb 33, Thebes, Egypt. From *Newsletter and Proceedings*, 87.03, with additions by Dr. Hilton.

"I found that the government had erected a guard house at the entrance to Tomb 33 and had an armed guard on duty 24 hours a day. I was successful, however, in finding the commissioner. He opened the steel door and took me inside the first two rooms. It was too dark to go any farther. I found ample evidence of ancient brickwork of the adobe type, many interior columns, and niches. Furthermore, I determined that the ceiling had fallen in on the room known as the Forecourt in the floor-plan diagram that you have. This room is the only one of the entire structure that has collapsed, and the present doorway is located along the west wall of the Forecourt. It covers the entry hall into Chamber I. (See Fig. 1.)

"Regarding the construction of brick: I found the brickwork very ancient on the south side of the area in front of the Forecourt. It was built as a great retaining wall. I took some excellent Super-8 movie films of this ancient brick structure, plus various corners of the Forecourt that still show above the debris, and in one place very beautiful hieroglyphic writings from the south wall of the Forecourt. It was too dark for me to get any interior shots.

"I was told by the commissioner that the tomb consisted of three levels: the one represented by the Forecourt and Chamber I, where we were standing; the next level down, shown as the middle set of rooms on your floor plan; and the third level down, represented by Chamber XI on your floor plan.

"Everything that I saw on my revisit further convinced me that Tomb 33 is, in fact, the place whence the papyrus of Abraham came. Nothing that I saw raised any doubt in my mind.

"If I can give any further information, I shall be happy to supply it. Best wishes in your important work."

124.2 STUDENTS VISIT TOMB 33, THEBES, EGYPT. By Susan Stiles Taylor. Dr. LaMar C. Berrett, long-time member of the SEHA and present chairman of the BYU Department of Church History and Doctrine, led a group of students on a BYU Travel-Study, Bible-Lands Tour this past spring. The group had the unparalleled opportunity while in Egypt of entering No. 33 among the "private tombs" at Thebes.

(Tomb 33 is the one where Antonio Lebolo made the mummy discovery in the early nineteenth century that later resulted in the Book of Abraham; see Newsletter, 87.0. Ed.)

The following is based on Dr. Berrett's report:

Having corresponded since the preceding fall with Henry Riad, chief curator of the Cairo National Museum, Dr. Berrett was able to secure permission for the group to go into the tomb and take pictures. This was evidently the first time anyone had been allowed this opportunity. They were likewise permitted to photograph in the Cairo Museum, also a rare privilege.

In Luxor, on Sunday morning. April 5, Dr. Berrett telephoned ahead to Gurneh in the Necropolis area to finalize visiting plans. However, Mohamed Saleh, the inspector at Gurneh, had left on vacation, and Mohamet Abalon, his assistant, who had the key to the tomb door, said they might not go in. It seemed that nothing could convince Mr. Abalon until, very fortunately, the latter received a telegram from Mr. Riad in Cairo telling him to let the group in and to let them take pictures. Thus, on Sunday afternoon, 46 persons entered the tomb.

Flashlights were the only source of light within the tomb; electricity had not been installed. Passing through the first small room containing storage boxes, they entered into Chambers I, II, and III, which were stored with mummies in various states of preservation, statues, and many boxes. The whole floor of Chamber III was filled with mummies.

The walls throughout these rooms were blackened with soot; many were rough and others smooth. It is speculated that in modern times the tomb may once have been used as a dwelling unit. Murals could be seen under the soot, although the group could not get a good look at them.

(Dr. Berrett will direct the annual "Land-of-the-Scriptures Workshop" next June and July, which is planned for 16 BYU faculty members and directors of LDS institutes of religion on sabbatical leave of absence, and their wives. The tour will pass through 13 foreign countries and will doubtless have the opportunity of visiting Tomb 33 at Thebes once again. Ed.)

124.3 **PUBLISHES IN PHILIPPINE JOURNAL.** Mr. J. Henry Baird is the author of two 20-page articles appearing in a recent issue of the *Journal of East Asiatic Studies* (Vol. 12, March, 1968).

Mr. Baird is an SEHA member and a former chief archaeologist of the Mariana Islands. In 1968 he read a paper at the Eighteenth Annual Symposium on the Archaeology of the Scriptures (Newsletter, 109.1) entitled "Bell or Spatula Tablets: A Comparative Study of Some New-World with Some Ancient Old-World Inscriptions."

The Journal of East Asiatic Studies is published by the University of Manila in cooperation with the Institute of International Studies of Western Michigan University. The two articles by Mr. Baird are entitled, "The Purpose of the Mariana 'Latte'" and "The Ainu of Japan: An Explorative Search for Their Origins."



6

Fig. 2. Present entrance to Tomb 33 at the Necropolis, western Thebes. The area in the immediate foreground is that of the collapsed Forecourt of the huge "catacomb." The modern steel gate, lower left, gives access to Chamber I. (See Fig. 1.) The light-colored structure in the background, right, is the mortuary temple of Queen Hatshepsut (1486-1468 BC) at Deir el-Bahri. The guard house is located in the left middleground. Photograph by Dr. Berrett.



Fig. 3. Dr. Berrett and local guard at the entrance to Tomb 33. Beyond the modern steel doorway is Chamber I (see ground plan, Fig. 1). Photograph by Dr. Berrett.